

1 MANATT, PHELPS & PHILLIPS, LLP
2 JOHN F. LIBBY (Bar No. CA 128207)
3 E-mail: jlibby@manatt.com
JOHN W. MCGUINNESS (Bar No. CA 277322)
4 E-mail: jmcguinness@manatt.com
EMIL PETROSSIAN (Bar No. CA 264222)
5 E-mail: epetrossian@manatt.com
11355 West Olympic Boulevard
6 Los Angeles, California 90064
Telephone: (310) 312-4000
Facsimile: (310) 312-4224

7 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs*
CITY OF SAN JOSE and BLACK ALLIANCE
8 FOR JUST IMMIGRATION

9 *[Additional Counsel Listed on Signature Page]*

10 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
11 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

12
13 CITY OF SAN JOSE, a municipal corporation;
14 and BLACK ALLIANCE FOR JUST
15 IMMIGRATION, a California Non-Profit
Corporation,

16 Plaintiffs,

17 v.
18 WILBUR L. ROSS, JR., in his official capacity
as Secretary of the U.S. Department of
Commerce; et al.,
19
20 Defendants.

Case No. 3:18-cv-02279

**JOINT STIPULATION AND
[PROPOSED] ORDER TO ADMIT
EVIDENCE IN LIEU OF TESTIMONY
FOR DR. LISA HANDLEY AND DR.
HERMANN HABERMANN**

Dept: 3
Judge: The Honorable Richard G.
Seeborg
Trial Date: January 7, 2019
Complaint Filed: April 17, 2018

21 STATE OF CALIFORNIA by and through
22 Attorney General Xavier Becerra; et al.,

23 Plaintiffs,

24 v.
25 WILBUR L. ROSS, JR., in his official capacity
as Secretary of the U.S. Department of
Commerce; et al.,
26
27 Defendants.

Case No. 3:18-cv-01865

1 **JOINT STIPULATION REGARDING THE TRIAL TESTIMONY OF**
2 **DR. LISA HANDLEY AND DR. HERMANN HABERMANN**

3 To promote efficiency and preserve judicial resources, Plaintiffs and Plaintiff-in-
4 Intervention, (collectively, “Plaintiffs”) and Defendants (collectively, “Parties”) in the cases of
5 *San Jose et al. v. Ross et al.*, 18-cv-2279, and *California et al. v. Ross et al.*, 18-cv-1865 have
6 reached an agreement regarding the admission of evidence in lieu of trial testimony for certain
7 expert witnesses who testified in *State of New York, et al. v. United States Department of*
8 *Commerce, et al.*, case no. 1:18-cv-02921 (“New York matter”). The Parties hereby stipulate as
9 follows:

10 1. Defendants’ position is that, because the Administrative Procedure Act (APA)
11 provides the waiver of sovereign immunity and the basis for review of Plaintiffs’ claims,
12 including their constitutional claim, this Court should confine its merits review to the
13 administrative record. The testimony of Drs. Lisa Handley and Hermann Habermann go directly
14 to the merits of Plaintiffs’ claims and, as Defendants will state in an upcoming motion *in limine*,
15 should therefore be excluded. Should this Court deny Defendants’ motion *in limine* and include
16 extra-record evidence in its review on the merits, Defendants stipulate to the procedure set forth
17 below.

18 2. Should any of the Plaintiffs move to admit the testimony of Dr. Hermann Habermann,
19 the complete trial testimony of Dr. Habermann set forth in pages 453:17- 471:13 of the transcript
20 of trial proceedings on November 6, 2018 in the New York matter, including Dr. Habermann’s
21 trial affidavit filed in the New York matter as Doc. 498-11, may be moved into evidence during
22 trial in the above-captioned case(s).

23 3. Should any of the Plaintiffs move to admit the testimony of Dr. Lisa Handley, the
24 complete trial testimony of Dr. Handley set forth in pages 786:10-856:15 of the transcript of trial
25 proceedings on November 13, 2018 in the New York matter may be moved into evidence during
26 trial in the above-captioned case(s).

27
28

1 4. The following demonstratives used during the witnesses' direct examination in the
2 New York matter may be considered by the Court for the limited purpose of assisting the Court in
3 understanding Dr. Handley's trial testimony: PDX 31, PDX 32, PDX 33, PDX 34, PDX 35, PDX
4 36, PDX 37, PDX 38, PDX 39, PDX 40, PX 32, PX 332, PX 504, and PX 535.

5 5. Plaintiffs reserve the right to also seek to admit into evidence PX 331, PX 332, PX
6 504, and PX 535 for other purposes at trial. Defendants reserve the right to object to their
7 admission for other purposes at that time.

8 **IT IS SO STIPULATED.**

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 Dated: December 17, 2018

MANATT, PHELPS & PHILLIPS, LLP

2 By: /s/ John F. Libby

John F. Libby

3 John W. McGuinness

Emil Petrossian

4 Andrew Case

Rory Adams

5 Ana G. Guardado

6 Olufunmilayo O. Showole

7 Salvador E. Perez

11355 West Olympic Boulevard

Los Angeles, California 90064

Telephone: (310) 312-4000

Facsimile: (310) 312-4224

10 **LAWYERS' COMMITTEE FOR CIVIL RIGHTS
UNDER LAW**

11 Kristen Clarke

12 Jon M. Greenbaum

Ezra D. Rosenberg

Dorian L. Spence

13 1500 K Street, NW, Suite 900

Washington, DC 20005

14 Telephone: (202) 662-8600

Facsimile: (202) 783-0857

15 **PUBLIC COUNSEL**

16 Mark Rosenbaum

17 610 South Ardmore Avenue

Los Angeles, California 90005

18 Telephone: (213) 385-2977

Facsimile: (213) 385-9089

19 **CITY OF SAN JOSE**

Richard Doyle, City Attorney

20 Nora Frimann, Assistant City Attorney

Office of the City Attorney

21 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor

San José, California 95113-1905

22 Telephone Number: (408) 535-1900

Facsimile Number: (408) 998-3131

23 E-Mail: cao.main@sanjoseca.gov

24 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs CITY OF SAN JOSE and
BLACK ALLIANCE FOR JUST IMMIGRATION*

1 Dated: December 17, 2018

XAVIER BECERRA
Attorney General of California
MARK R. BECKINGTON
ANTHONY R. HAKL
Supervising Deputy Attorneys General
ANNA T. FERRARI
TODD GRABARSKY
R. MATTHEW WISE
NOREEN P. SKELLY
Deputy Attorneys General

11 Dated: December 17, 2018

DANNIS WOLIVER KELLEY
SUE ANN SALMON EVANS
KEITH A. YEOMANS

16 Dated: December 17, 2018

JOSEPH H. HUNT
Assistant Attorney General

BRETT A. SHUMATE
Deputy Assistant Attorney General

CARLOTTA P. WELLS
Assistant Branch Director

21 /s/ Kate Bailey

KATE BAILEY
STEPHEN EHRLICH
CAROL FEDERIGHI
Trial Attorneys
United States Department of Justice
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch
1100 L Street NW
Washington, DC 20530
Phone: (202) 514-9239
Email: kate.bailey@usdoj.gov
Attorneys for Defendants

1 **FILER'S ATTESTATION**

2 Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 5-1(i)(3), regarding signatures, Gabrielle D. Boutin hereby
3 attests that concurrence in the filing of this document has been obtained from all the signatories
4 above.

5 Dated: December 17, 2018

s/ Gabrielle D. Boutin
6 Gabrielle D. Boutin

7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

[PROPOSED] ORDER

2 Based on the parties' Stipulation to Admit Evidence in Lieu of Testimony for Dr. Lisa
3 Handley and Dr. Hermann Habermann, and good cause appearing, this Court finds the complete
4 trial testimony of Dr. Lisa Handley and Dr. Hermann Habermann, including Dr. Habermann's
5 trial affidavit, in *State of New York, et al. v. United States Department of Commerce, et al.*, case
6 no. 1:18-cv-02921 (the "New York matter"), may be moved into evidence during trial in the
7 above-captioned case(s) should any of the Plaintiffs move to admit such testimony and if the
8 Court rejects Defendants' motion *in limine* for exclusion of all extra-record evidence.

9 6. The Court may rely upon the following demonstratives used during trial in the New
10 York matter for the limited purpose of assisting the Court in understanding Dr. Handley's trial
11 testimony: PDX 31, PDX 32, PDX 33, PDX 34, PDX 35, PDX 36, PDX 37, PDX 38, PDX 39,
12 PDX 40, PX 32, PX 332, PX 504, and PX 535. Plaintiffs may also seek to admit into evidence
13 PX 331, PX 332, PX 504, and PX 535 for other purposes at trial and Defendants may object to
14 such admission at that time.

PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED: _____

HON. RICHARD SEEBORG
United States District Court Judge

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Case Name: **State of California, et al. v.
Wilbur L. Ross, et al.**

No. **3:18-cv-01865**

I hereby certify that on December 18, 2018, I electronically filed the following documents with the Clerk of the Court by using the CM/ECF system:

**JOINT STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER TO ADMIT EVIDENCE IN LIEU
OF TESTIMONY FOR DR. LISA HANDLEY AND DR. HERMANN HABERMANN**

I certify that **all** participants in the case are registered CM/ECF users and that service will be accomplished by the CM/ECF system.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California the foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed on December 18, 2018, at Sacramento, California.

Eileen A. Ennis
Declarant

/s/ *Eileen A. Ennis*
Signature

SA2018100904
13371289.docx